

Thursday, March 7, 2019  
6:00 p.m.  
City of Turlock Yosemite Room  
156 S. Broadway, Turlock, California

MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
Turlock Planning Commission

---

**A. 1. CALL TO ORDER** – Commissioner Reape called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

PRESENT: Commissioners Jim Reape, Constance Anderson, Matthew Davis, Anokeen Varani and Elvis Dias.

ABSENT: Commissioner Geoff Powers

**2. OATH OF OFFICE FOR NEWLY APPOINTED COMMISSIONERS (City Clerk**

City Clerk, Jennifer Land, swore in the newly appointed Planning Commissioner Elvis Dias. Commissioner Dias was seated at the dais.

**3. ELECTION OF OFFICERS:**

**Motion:** Commissioner Anderson motioned, seconded by Commissioner Davis to elect Commissioner Powers as Chair for 2019. Motion carried unanimously.

**Motion:** Commissioner Varani motioned, seconded by Commissioner Davis to elect Commissioner Reape as Vice Chair for 2019. Motion carried unanimously.

**B. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

1. Accepting minutes of Planning Commission meeting of January 17, 2019.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Varani seconded by Commissioner Anderson to accept the minutes as submitted.

AYES: Commissioners Anderson, Davis, Reape and Varani

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Dias

ABSENT: Commissioner Powers

**C. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

1. Principle Planner Katie Quintero introduced the new Assistant Planner Katherine Bakus.
2. Planner Quintero noted staff received two letters from neighbors regarding G.1 Amendment to Planned Development 272. The letters were provided as green sheets to the Commission on the dais.

**D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Commissioner Reape opened the floor for Public Participation.

Hearing no one, Commissioner Reape closed the floor for Public Participation.

**E. 1. DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST AND DISQUALIFICATIONS**

**2. DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

**F. CONSENT CALENDAR**

None

**G. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**\*CONSENT ITEMS**

None

**NONCONSENT ITEMS**

*These items will be individually discussed and reviewed in detail.*

**1. AMENDMENT TO PLANNED DEVELOPMENT 272 (The Vista Student Housing):**

Principal Planner Katie Quintero presented the staff report explaining the applicant is requesting to amend Planned Development 272 to allow an additional 60 beds for The Vista Student Housing project, bringing the total bed count up from 660 to 720. No physical changes would be required to the building to accommodate the increase in beds.

The student housing project is unique and the Turlock Municipal code does not have a standard for parking requirements. Staff used ITE for a resource to calculate the parking; the typical multi-family parking standard would require 300 parking spaces. The Vistas original parking ratio was .98 spaces per bed, the 2017 amendment changed ratio to .89 spaces per bed and the current request would make it .82 spaces per bed. In April 2017, the applicant prepared a parking analysis survey of two apartment complexes in Turlock. On average, one parking space per every two beds is required.

The Planning Division received two letters from neighbors concerned with safety, noise and security. The Vistas have their own onsite management and security. Turlock police pulled the call logs for service from 3/1/18 - 2/28/19 showing 41 calls attributed to The Vistas address. This included all calls made on the street and sidewalk with no specific pattern to the calls received by Turlock Police department.

Commissioner Reape asked if offsite parking in neighborhoods had changed.

Planner Quintero stated there is no way for staff to track the changes in the neighborhood.

---

Commissioner Dias expressed concern regarding safety caused by the additional occupants.

Planner Quintero stated occupant load was of concern; however, the project was routed to the Building and Fire Departments for review and comment. During review of the building permit, the Building and Fire departments will review the project for life and safety issues including exiting and occupant load. She stated the Fire department has a ladder truck capable of accessing the 4-story buildings.

David Moon, the applicant, explained the additional beds are double occupancy and the least expensive rooms and are currently 100% occupied with a wait list. The addition of the 60 beds will provide 60 students the opportunity to live in a complex with professional management and onsite programs. The parking lot currently has 144 unassigned parking spaces. The management lives onsite and security patrols the property every night from 9 p.m. to 4 a.m. and two security guards onsite on the weekends. The neighbors can call the security office directly regarding any problems.

Commissioner Anderson asked if the Vistas were 100% occupied and what rate were returning students.

Mr. Moon stated they are preleasing for next year for the larger rooms with 50-55% renewal rate.

Commissioner Anderson inquired if double occupancy is requested or if students were paired up.

Mr. Moon stated they receive requests for both.

Commissioner Varani and Anderson inquired about the comparison of the security companies logs with Turlock Police Departments logs.

Mr. Moon stated the security company keeps the logs however Ryan Baker, the on-site manager, has not heard from any neighbors since becoming the general manager. Suggested that neighbors call Ryan directly with all concerns not the police.

Ryan Baker, on site manager, stated his location has access to the basketball courts and can hear amenities. Has security patrol buildings, pool area, and clubhouse every night and logs the activities. He provided his contact information to the neighbors to contact him directly and not the police department with any concerns or complaints.

Commissioner Anderson asked what relationship the Vistas have with Stanislaus Police?

Ryan Baker answered they gave them the codes to get in the Vista's parking lot to patrol.

Commissioner Dias asked when dispatch is called, who would respond?

Planner Katie Quintero stated the call would go to Turlock Police Department.

Interim Director Nathan Bray stated there is a mutual aid response with CSUS.

Commissioner Anderson was concerned the rooms are being rented to students only.

David Moon stated applicants provide student ids, proof of financial aide, and class schedules but do not have to attend Stan State of Turlock. Students from Merced and Modesto are also allowed to live there.

Commission Anderson asked if the shuttle service was widely used.

David Moon stated the students were not using it so it was stopped since September 2018.

### **Public Hearing**

Commissioner Reape opened the public hearing.

Nanette Snoke, neighbor, spoke against the project, stating the noise should stop at 10:00 p.m. but continues until 2:00 a.m. She stated there has been no communication with the manager and suggested more communication with the neighbors would help.

John Snoke, head of the neighborhood watch, has met with the previous manager to talk about the noise and traffic. He is concerned the 60 additional beds will increase the existing problems.

Robert Puffer, spoke in favor of project, stating there are plenty of empty parking spots to accommodate the additional beds.

Commissioner Reape closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Dias stated better communication is needed between the neighbors and The Vistas. He expressed concern with the safety of building with the additional students. He does not see an issue with parking and would like to see the project move forward.

Commissioner Anderson spoke against project. She expressed her concern with how the complex interplays with the neighborhood. She would like The Vistas to address the concerns raised by the neighbors before approving the project.

Commissioner Reape thanked the neighbors and property owners for their comments.

Commissioner Dias asked Ryan Baker, the onsite manager, to provide neighbors with phone numbers to call if they have complaints.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Dias moved, seconded by Commissioner Varani determining that no subsequent environmental impact report or negative declaration is required to approve the proposed amendment to Planned Development 272 and

approving the proposed amendments to the conditions of approval for Planned Development 272 (The Vista Student Housing Project), having determined the appropriate findings can be made, and subject to the conditions contained in Draft Planning Commission Resolution 2019-04.

AYES: Commissioners Davis, Reape, Varani, and Dias  
NOES: Commissioner Anderson  
ABSTAIN: None  
RECUSED: None  
ABSENT: Commissioner Powers

**H. OTHER MATTERS**

None

**I. COMMISSIONERS CONSIDERATION**

None

**J. STANISLAUS COUNTY PLANNING REFERRAL ITEMS**

None

**K. COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS**

Commissioner Anderson recognized Joanne Foster as the employee of the month.

**L. STAFF UPDATES**

Interim Director Nathan Bray informed the Commissioners that Turlock Transit is soliciting feedback for short range traffic plans for the bus routes. The opportunity to provide input can be done on our website or at one of the four meetings in March. Flyers detailing the meeting times and dates were handed out to the Commissioners.

**M. ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner Reape asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Motion by Commissioner Anderson and carried unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 7:11 p.m.

**RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED**

---

Jim Reape  
Vice Chairman

---

Katie Quintero  
Principal Planner